

Comments to TEMPTATION GOODS AND CONDITIONAL CASH TRANSFERS IN PERU (Dasso, R. and Fernández, F.)

Seventh Annual Meeting of the IMPACT EVALUATION
NETWORK (IEN)

Carolina Lopez

CEDLAS-UNLP

October, 2013

Contribution

- Unexplored topic in Latin America
- Undesirable effects of CCT
- CCT and *temptation goods* \Rightarrow inconsistency with the permanent income hypothesis?
- Relevant outcome for the design of public policies

Contribution

- Unexplored topic in Latin America
- Undesirable effects of CCT
- CCT and *temptation goods* \Rightarrow inconsistency with the permanent income hypothesis?
- Relevant outcome for the design of public policies

Contribution

- Unexplored topic in Latin America
- Undesirable effects of CCT
- CCT and *temptation goods* \Rightarrow inconsistency with the permanent income hypothesis?
- Relevant outcome for the design of public policies

Contribution

- Unexplored topic in Latin America
- Undesirable effects of CCT
- CCT and *temptation goods* \Rightarrow inconsistency with the permanent income hypothesis?
- Relevant outcome for the design of public policies

Contribution

- Unexplored topic in Latin America
- Undesirable effects of CCT
- CCT and *temptation goods* \Rightarrow inconsistency with the permanent income hypothesis?
- Relevant outcome for the design of public policies

Comments

- Identification strategy
 - Changes in consumption patterns
 - Expenditure distribution optimal strategy
- Do recipients know in advance the timing of cash?

⇒ Possible adjustment of the moment they make purchases

Comments

- Identification strategy
 - Changes in consumption patterns
 - Expenditure distribution optimal strategy
- Do recipients know in advance the timing of cash?

⇒ Possible adjustment of the moment they make purchases

Comments

- Identification strategy
 - Changes in consumption patterns
 - Expenditure distribution optimal strategy
- Do recipients know in advance the timing of cash?

⇒ Possible adjustment of the moment they make purchases

Comments

- Identification strategy
 - Changes in consumption patterns
 - Expenditure distribution optimal strategy
- Do recipients know in advance the timing of cash?

⇒ Possible adjustment of the moment they make purchases

Comments (1)

- Explain the payment system
- Beneficiaries are in rural areas
 - travel to get paid
 - access to this type of goods
- Planning the purchase of these goods to the time in which they know they have to travel
- May not involve immediate consumption of these goods

Comments (1)

- Explain the payment system
- Beneficiaries are in rural areas
 - travel to get paid
 - access to this type of goods
- Planning the purchase of these goods to the time in which they know they have to travel
- May not involve immediate consumption of these goods

Comments (1)

- Explain the payment system
- Beneficiaries are in rural areas
 - travel to get paid
 - access to this type of goods
- Planning the purchase of these goods to the time in which they know they have to travel
- May not involve immediate consumption of these goods

Comments (1)

- Explain the payment system
- Beneficiaries are in rural areas
 - travel to get paid
 - access to this type of goods
- Planning the purchase of these goods to the time in which they know they have to travel
- May not involve immediate consumption of these goods

Comments (1)

- Explain the payment system
- Beneficiaries are in rural areas
 - travel to get paid
 - access to this type of goods
- Planning the purchase of these goods to the time in which they know they have to travel
- May not involve immediate consumption of these goods

Comments (1)

- In 2009, 80 % of recipients were people working in the agricultural sector (ENAHO)
- Average earnings were about 600 soles per month
- Recipients have children in their families (potential main consumers of chocolates, candies, soft drinks)

Comments (1)

- In 2009, 80 % of recipients were people working in the agricultural sector (ENAHO)
- Average earnings were about 600 soles per month
- Recipients have children in their families (potential main consumers of chocolates, candies, soft drinks)

Comments (1)

- In 2009, 80 % of recipients were people working in the agricultural sector (ENAHO)
- Average earnings were about 600 soles per month
- Recipients have children in their families (potential main consumers of chocolates, candies, soft drinks)

Comments (1)

- In 2009, 80 % of recipients were people working in the agricultural sector (ENAHO)
- Average earnings were about 600 soles per month
- Recipients have children in their families (potential main consumers of chocolates, candies, soft drinks)

Comments (II)

- No impact of the program in milk, eggs, beans and fruits
- Analyze access (purchase / self consumption / barter)
- Try to determine how they get what they consume

Comments (II)

- No impact of the program in milk, eggs, beans and fruits
- Analyze access (purchase / self consumption / barter)
- Try to determine how they get what they consume

Comments (II)

- No impact of the program in milk, eggs, beans and fruits
- Analyze access (purchase / self consumption / barter)
- Try to determine how they get what they consume

Comments (II)

- No impact of the program in milk, eggs, beans and fruits
- Analyze access (purchase / self consumption / barter)
- Try to determine how they get what they consume

Possible ways to discard the problem

- Capturing changes in consumption patterns or not
- Try to use the panel structure of the ENAHO (since 2008)
- Compare with simple differences : consumption patterns

Possible ways to discard the problem

- Capturing changes in consumption patterns or not
- Try to use the panel structure of the ENAHO (since 2008)
- Compare with simple differences : consumption patterns

Possible ways to discard the problem

- Capturing changes in consumption patterns or not
- Try to use the panel structure of the ENAHO (since 2008)
- Compare with simple differences : consumption patterns

Comments (III)

- Placebo test
- How comparable are the poor used in the test with recipients of Juntos?
- If they are poor, but do not have children under 14 years old (not eligible) it is not expected to find effects on the goods for which impacts were found
- Disaggregate measure of consumption in Table 6 and analyze those goods separately

Comments (III)

- Placebo test
- How comparable are the poor used in the test with recipients of Juntos?
- If they are poor, but do not have children under 14 years old (not eligible) it is not expected to find effects on the goods for which impacts were found
- Disaggregate measure of consumption in Table 6 and analyze those goods separately

Comments (III)

- Placebo test
- How comparable are the poor used in the test with recipients of Juntos?
- If they are poor, but do not have children under 14 years old (not eligible) it is not expected to find effects on the goods for which impacts were found
- Disaggregate measure of consumption in Table 6 and analyze those goods separately

Comments (III)

- Placebo test
- How comparable are the poor used in the test with recipients of Juntos?
- If they are poor, but do not have children under 14 years old (not eligible) it is not expected to find effects on the goods for which impacts were found
- Disaggregate measure of consumption in Table 6 and analyze those goods separately

Comments (III)

- Placebo test
- How comparable are the poor used in the test with recipients of Juntos?
- If they are poor, but do not have children under 14 years old (not eligible) it is not expected to find effects on the goods for which impacts were found
- Disaggregate measure of consumption in Table 6 and analyze those goods separately

Thanks!